

CITY OF GERMANTOWN
DESIGN REVIEW COMMISSION
CITY HALL COUNCIL CHAMBERS
Tuesday, February 25, 2020
6:00 p.m.

1. Call to Order: Chairman Paul Bruns called the meeting to order at 6:10 p.m.
2. Roll Call and Establishment of a Quorum: Regina Gibson called the roll and established a quorum.

Members Present: Chairman Paul Bruns; Vice-Chairman Christopher Schmidt; Secretary Robert Sloan; Alderman Forrest Owens; Patricia Sherman; Neeraj Kumar; Brian Carney and Brian White.

Members Absent: Tim Gibson

Staff Present: Cameron Ross, Economic and Community Development Director; Sheila Pounder, Planning Division Manager; Sarah Goralewski, Senior Planner; Regina Gibson, Staff Secretary and Robert McLean, Assistant City Attorney.

3. Approval of the Minutes

Mr. Sloan moved to approve the Design Review Commission minutes of January 28, 2020, seconded by Alderman Owens.

ROLL CALL:

Owens – Yes
Kumar- Yes
Sherman – Yes
Schmidt – Yes
Gibson - Yes
White – Yes
Carney - Yes
Bruns - Yes

MOTION PASSED 8-0-0

4. Consent Agenda*

- A. Case Number & Project Name: (18-812) Apple
Location: 2051 West St. (Saddle Creek South)
Property Owner: Trademark Property – Kenneth Taylor (Property Management Company)
Tenant: Apple – Stephen Myers
Applicant: Glassman Planning Associates – Michelle Slayden, Agent
Request: Approval of a Revised Wall Sign
- B. Case Number & Project Name: (20-002) First Horizon
Location: 9185 Winchester Rd.
Property Owner: First Horizon Bank – Mike Tapp, Real Estate Senior VP
Applicant: Frank Balton Signs – Chris Haskins, Agent

- Request: Approval of a Revised Ground-Mounted Sign (Illumination)
- C. Case Number & Project Name: (15-547) Village Shops of Forest Hill
Location: 9155 Poplar Ave.
Property Owner/Applicant: EREP Forest Hill I, LLC – Nancy Edwards – Director/Property Management
Representative: Traditional Construction – Ryan McDurmon, VP - Contractor
Request: Approval of a Dumpster Enclosure
- D. Case Number & Project Name: (20-003) Baptist Rehabilitation Hospital
Location: 1240 S. Germantown Rd.
Property Owner/Applicant: Baptist Memorial Health Care Corp. – Greg Duckett, Sr. VP/CLO
Developer: Kindred Healthcare – Jason Casteel, Director of Construction
Request: Approval of Building Modification (6,000 sq.ft. addition) and Minor Site Modifications (Landscape Plan Improvements and Parking Expansion)
- E. Case Number & Project Name: (19-937) 2100 Exeter Rd. (former Baptist Specialty Hospital)
Location: 2100 & 2120 Exeter Rd.
Property Owner/Applicant: Healthcare Realty, Inc. – Greg Smith, Vice President – Investments
Representative: A2H – David Smith, Agent
Request: Approval of Façade Modifications and Landscape Plan Improvements for Medical Offices
- F. Case Number & Project Name: (19-946) Evangelical Christian School
Location: 1920 Forest Hill-Irene Rd.
Property Owner/Applicant: Evangelical Christian School – Braxton Brady, Head of School
Representative: Archimania – Todd Steele, Agent
Request: Approval of a Revised Final Site Plan (Building Addition - 11,655 s.f., Revised Landscape Plan and Tree Mitigation)

* Refer to complete applications, staff reports and attachments on file.

Secretary Sloan moved to approve the Consent Agenda, seconded by Vice Chairman Schmidt.

ROLL CALL:

Sherman – Yes

Kumar – Yes, but recused himself from Agenda Item No. 4B

Sloan – Yes, but recused himself from Agenda Item No. 4C

Carney – Yes

Owens – Yes, but recused himself from Agenda Item No. 4F

White – Yes

Schmidt – Yes

Bruns – Yes

MOTION PASSED 8-0-0

5. Regular Agenda

- A. Case Number & Project Name: (18-809) Dogwood Elementary School
Location: 8945 Dogwood Rd.
Owner/Applicant: Germantown Municipal School District (GMSD) – Jason Manuel, Superintendent
Developer: TVT 1, LLC – Jay Lindy, Partner
Representative: Prime Development Group – Michael Fahy, Agent
Request: Approval of a Revised Preliminary and Final Site Plan for a New Wireless Transmission Facility (140 ft. Cell Tower)

* Refer to complete application, staff report and attachments on file.

Alderman Owens recused himself from this item.

Cameron Ross made a staff presentation.

The developer's representative, Michael Fahy, Agent (with Prime Development Group on behalf of the developer, TVT 1, LLC), addressed the Commission.

The Commission discussed the request with the applicant and staff.

Chairman Bruns requested anyone wishing to speak in favor of this request, to come forward and state their name and address. There were none.

Chairman Bruns requested anyone wishing to speak against this request, to come forward and state their name and address. The following residents spoke against the item:

Ms. Sophia Cole (9196 Sycamore Creek Cove)
Ms. Kristen Waddell (8345 Glen Meadow Lane)
Ms. Casey Carrillo (8986 Ashmere Drive)
Ms. Bess Warren (2489 Netherhall Drive)
Mr. Ryan Scoggen (9516 Doe Meadow Drive)
Ms. Jennifer Bell (2111 Preswick Drive)
Mr. Jesse Moore (2651 Holly Springs Drive)

Chairman Bruns closed the floor and called for a motion.

MOTION:

Secretary Sloan made a motion to approve a revised preliminary and final site plan for a new 140 ft. high wireless transmission facility (cell tower), including the tree mitigation as proposed, as well as exceptions to the landscape screening requirement per Sec. 23-86(i)(1) and the allowable fence height per Sec. 6-102, at Dogwood Elementary School (8945 Dogwood Rd.), subject to the Commission's discussion, staff comments in the staff report, and the documents and plans submitted with the application, seconded by Vice Chairman Schmidt.

ROLL CALL:

Owens – Recused himself from this item.

Schmidt – No, the current proposal doesn't meet the high design standards and expectations of this commission, as outlined in the ordinance and the design review guidelines.

Sloan – Yes, this tower at 140 ft. high can accommodate up to 4 users and prevents 3 additional towers from being required at the previous 100 ft. height. The DRC has gone to great lengths to require this developer to add additional curb appeal for the benefit of the city.

Sherman – Yes, this request meets the required guidelines.

Carney – Yes, as stated by Mr. Sloan.

Kumar – Yes, looking at this from the DRC’s authority and these items, the request meets the design intent and the safety requirements.

White – Yes, the design review of this was approved the last time this item came before this commission. Due to the guidelines that are given to the DRC, that same decision is supported.

Bruns – Yes, this commission is tasked with a very specific criteria related to aesthetics. The location and height have been determined, and child safety has been discussed. This has nothing to do with the commission’s decision. The applicant has done its best to make sure, while it is a 140 ft. cell tower, it is concealed as best as it can be on this site. That is what this commission is tasked with.

MOTION PASSED 6-1-0

6. Old Business:

Chairman Bruns asked if there was any old business and there was none.

7. New Business:

Chairman Bruns asked if there was any new business and there was none.

8. Adjournment:

There being no further business, comments, or questions by the Commission, Chairman Bruns announced the meeting was adjourned at 7:41 p.m.

Paul Bruns, Chairman
Design Review Commission
